

Beacon Hill Architectural Commission

Public Hearing Minutes

Boston City Hall, Piemonte Room

Boston, MA, 02201

February 21, 2019

Commissioners Present: Paul Donnelly, Joel Pierce, Miguel Rosales, Kenneth Taylor

Commissioners Not Present: P. T. Vineburgh, Danielle Santos

Staff Present: Joe Cornish, Gabriela Amore

5:05 PM K. Taylor called the public hearing to order.

Violations

45 Beacon Street (19.777 BH): Ratification of the existing grade in Spruce Place; repair masonry at rear elevation of Carriage Barn; replace two missing granite bollards at east and west corners of Carriage Barn; modify door at rear elevation of Carriage Barn by extending its length and lowering bottom jamb; and install asphalt berm at rear wall of Carriage barn.

Representative: Robert McLaughlin, Jonathan Detwiler, Howard Goldberg

Mr. Detwiler presented photos of existing conditions and plans showing the length of the door being extended, plans for the installation of an asphalt berm, and explained that the original bollards have been removed. He also explained that the door they propose to extend is not compliant with any codes, and the Inspectional Services Department is aware of it, and approve of the work. Mr. Goldberg explained that the pavers were approved in their initial application and serve as assistance for disabled people so that they can clearly see the elevation.

Commissioner J. Pierce entered the chambers.

The Commission addressed the proposed door modification, and questioned Mr. Detwiler about how he plans on extending the length of the existing door, and how much the threshold will be lowered. The Commission learned that the door threshold would be lowered 8 inches. They also addressed the berm proposed between the paving and brick wall, suggesting that it should be granite instead of asphalt.

During public comment, Martha McNamara felt that drawings should be submitted by the applicant showing an option for a granite berm. She also expressed concern over the wellbeing of other buildings on Spruce Place and whether any are being affected by water. Jim Rosenfeld from the Beacon Hill Civic Association stated that he felt the proposed berm should be granite rather than asphalt.

A motion to approve the door, brick replacement, bollards, and asphalt berm, along with ratification of the grade was presented. K. Taylor initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 2-2 (Y: KT, PD; N: JP, MR). The motion did not pass.

- In conclusion, there was a motion to continue the application. P. Donnelly initiated the motion and M. Rosales seconded the motion. The vote was 3-1 (Y: PD, JP, MR; N: KT).

8 Joy Street (19.789 BH): At front façade and side elevation replace sixteen wood windows and 14 window casings in-kind; and at front façade and side elevation repair five wood windows and seven window casings.

Representative: James McClutchy

Mr. McClutchy explained that he was trying to handle the removal of asbestos on his property, and that the people working on the project removed his windows without his permission. He stated that it was his mistake that he did not explicitly tell the workers not to touch the windows. He plans on having his proposed windows replicate the ones at 10 Joy Street. He also stated that they plan on keeping as much original material as possible, and just removing rotted material.

The Commission pointed out that there are some details lacking from the application, specifically work to the window lintels and sills which must match the width of the window openings, and that he should return with information about all work being proposed at the property.

There was no public comment.

- In conclusion the application was continued. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (PD, JP, MR, KT).

Design Review

71 Chestnut Street (19.525 BH): At front façade re-point masonry; replace all sills and lintels with cast stone; remove existing iron grate over door and iron gate at door alcove; clean rust off existing steel beam and re-paint; replace existing wood panels in transom over double doors with new glass panes; repair all doors; replace deteriorated sections of wood trim in-kind; Replace first-story sixteen-light wood window in-kind; and re-paint all exterior wood elements.

Representative: Jennifer Mello

Ms. Mello presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work, and provided samples for the proposed paint colors.

The Commission questioned the accuracy of the drawings and treatment of the space between the window sash and window lintels. Ms. Mello clarified that the space in question is an existing condition and that everything within the window opening will be painted white. The Commission discussed the proposed paint color for the lower level and agreed that the proposed grey color is too dark. The Commission clarified other small details of the proposed work such as the plans

for the lintels and doors, and whether or not the existing door hardware should be retained as proposed.

During public comment, Jim Rosenfeld of the Beacon Hill Civic Association stated that his group has no objection to the proposed work. Stephen Skinner, an abutter from 73 Chestnut Street, also stated that he has no objection to the proposed work.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (PD, JP, MR, DS).**
 - All woodwork and sash be painted the same monochromatic grey color that exists at 88 Charles Street as illustrated in the presentation.

99 Pinckney Street (19.785 BH): At front sidewalk remove existing concrete slab and coal chute, install new blue stone slab matching the dimensions of the blue stone slab at 97 Pinckney Street, water proof membrane and brick pavers, and install coal chute cap.

Representatives: Nicole Reeves

Ms. Reeves presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work, and stated that she plans to match her neighbor's coal chute at 97 Pinckney Street. She also intends on keeping the coal chute cover she already has, and has pre-existing bricks in her basement to supply the contractor with so that the bricks all match.

The Commission stated that the bricks being used in the proposed work must match the existing.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. P. Donnelly initiated the motion and M. Rosales seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP).**
 - **Bricks must match the surrounding bricks.**

35 Mount Vernon Street (19.731 BH): At front façade replace entry doors in-kind, and install new address numbers.

Representatives: Sean P. Cryts

Mr. Cryts presented photos of existing conditions and plans for proposed work. He explained that he is proposing to replace the existing doors in kind, and keep the original lock mechanism and door arm. He also proposed to move the location of the address numbers. He explained that the doors are in poor condition and held together by plaster in several locations. He confirmed that the jambs will remain in place.

The Commission questioned the originality of the existing doors, and determined that they were not due to their Italianate style. They suggested moving all the hardware onto one door, and placing the knocker and address numbers on the same panel.

Public comment was opened and Jim Rosenfeld from the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that his association endorses the project, but are opposed to the proposed address numbers.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelley seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP).**
 - the door knocker be relocated to the right door;
 - the address numbers are re-used and attached with nails at their current location; and
 - a simple brass knob (as shown in the Period Furniture and Hardware Company, Inc. product description dated July 16, 2018) replaces the existing knob.

12 Byron Street (19.774 BH): At front façade install four storm windows at second story.

Representatives: Timothy Burke

Mr. Burke presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work. He explained that the proposed storm windows would be painted all black, with half screens.

The Commission clarified some details of the project including screen sizes and proposed colors. They also stated that in general, they do not approve screens.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion the application was approved. J Pierce initiated the motion and P. Donnelley seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP).**

84 Chestnut Street (19.648 BH): Install two awnings at storefront windows.

Representatives: Peter Wheeler

Mr. Wheeler presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work, and provided a sample of the material for the proposed awnings.

The Commission discussed the appearance of the awnings which seemed to be not functional, and only decorative. They also felt that the awnings did not fit in well with the character of the district.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion the application was denied. P. Donnelly initiated the motion and M. Rosales seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP).**

85 Pinckney Street (19.682 BH): At front façade replace second story non-historic French doors and transoms with double-hung six-over-nine wood windows

Representatives: Beth Spencer

Ms. Spencer presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work, and stated that some aspects of her proposed work were on the Administrative Review.

The Commission clarified small details of the project, and discussed the history of the French doors.

Public comment was opened and Jim Rosenfeld from the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that his association wants the French doors to stay in place. He also suggested using 6-over-6-over-6 windows rather than 6-over-9. Martha McNamara expressed her opinion that the French doors are significant and not be replaced.

Staff read its application to approve the application.

A motion to approve the application as submitted was presented. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 2-2 (Y: MR, PD; N: JP, KT). The motion did not pass.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. K. Taylor initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 2-1-1 (Y: KT, JP; N: MR; ABS: PD).**
 - **French Doors and transoms must be replaced in-kind.**

28 Pinckney Street (19.744 BH): Replace existing in-filled garage door opening with new overhead garage door painted black; paint existing door black; remove existing paint from masonry; and restore curb cut and sidewalk (work previously approved by BHAC on June 18, 2015).

Representatives: Monika Pauli, Fred Lebow

Ms. Pauli presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for proposed work.

The Commission expressed concern about the proposed curb cut, the scope of work to replace the transformer vaults, and changes to the sill at the building. They determined more information was needed about the changes to the curb, sidewalk, vault openings and grills, and sill at garage door opening. The Commission also asked for clarity about the work being proposed by Eversource.

There was no public comment.

- **In conclusion the application was continued. K. Taylor initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP).**

156 Cambridge Street (a/k/a 83 Joy Street) (19.695 BH): At roof replace three existing panel antennas with six panel antennas, and replace one canister enclosure with new stealth enclosure to house relocated antennas.

Representatives: Michael Dolan

Mr. Dolan presented photos of existing conditions and plans for proposed work.

The Commission felt that the new enclosure is not appropriate for the district, and was too visible.

Public comment was opened and Jim Rosenfeld from the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) asked why a mockup was not created.

Staff read its recommendation to deny the application without prejudice.

- **In conclusion the application was denied. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (KT, PD, MR, JP).**

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

19.698 BH 20 Chestnut Street: At rear elevation remove screening/fencing and HVAC condensers at garage roof; repair and replace copper flashing at garage roof; and re-paint garage door and windows black.

19.770 BH 31 Mount Vernon Street: At side and rear elevations replace three second-story six-over-two non-historic wood windows in-kind.

19.682 BH 85 Pinckney Street: At front façade replace all first, third, fourth and fifth-story six-over-six non-historic wood windows in-kind, and at rear elevation replace all third, fourth and fifth-story six-over-six non-historic wood windows in-kind (See Design Review item above).

19.712 BH 24 West Cedar Street: At rear elevation remove air-conditioning unit at sidewall and infill with brick to match the surrounding masonry.

19.699 BH 26 West Cedar Street: Replace slate roof in-kind; and at front façade replace copper gutter in-kind.

In conclusion the applications above were approved. P. Donnelly initiated the motion and K. Taylor seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (MR, JP, PD, KT).

Ratification of the January 17, 2019 Public Hearing Minutes

- **In conclusion the minutes were approved. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. Donnelly seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (MR, JP, PD, KT).**

STAFF COMMENTS: Staff reported that Commissioner Taylor will be resigning from the Commission at the conclusion of this hearing to relocate to New York City. Commissioner Taylor was thanked for his years of service.

8:15 PM K. Taylor adjourned the public hearing.