

Beacon Hill Architectural Commission
Public Hearing Minutes
Boston City Hall, Piemonte Room
Boston, MA, 02201

April 18, 2019

Commissioners Present: Joel Pierce, Miguel Rosales, Danielle Santos, P. T. Vineburgh

Commissioners Not Present: Paul Donnelly

Staff Present: Joseph Cornish

5:00 PM M. Rosales called the public hearing to order.

Violations

45 Beacon Street (19.777 BH): Ratification of the existing grade in Spruce Place; repair masonry at rear elevation of Carriage Barn; replace two missing granite bollards at east and west corners of Carriage Barn; modify door at rear elevation of Carriage Barn by extending its length and lowering bottom jamb; and install asphalt berm at rear wall of Carriage barn.

Representative: Robert E. McLaughlin, Sr. Esq.

Mr. McLaughlin presented photos of existing conditions and changes made since the February 21, 2019 public hearing, and Jonathan Detwiler discussed the appropriateness of an asphalt berm and the potential problems that a granite berm would create at this location.

The Commission discussed using a granite berm that is waterproofed and acknowledged the public support to approve an asphalt berm.

During public comment Alan Lipkind, legal counsel for Historic New England which holds a preservation easement on the property, explained that organization's opposition to a granite berm because it would create a false impression of the foundation material, alter Charles Bulfinch's design, and potentially damage the historic masonry at this location. Josh Grossman, legal counsel for abutters at 22, 24, 28, 30 and 32 Chestnut Street spoke in favor of the proposed asphalt berm. Richelle Gewertz from the Beacon Hill Civic Association stated that this is a matter that should be resolved by the abutters of Spruce Place.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion, there was a motion to approve the application as submitted. P. T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 2-2 (Y: DS, PTV; N: JP, MR). The motion failed. There was a second motion to approve part of the application with the exception of the asphalt berm which was denied without prejudice. P. T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**

Design Review

33 Chestnut Street (19.986 BH): At front façade install black steel handrail at entry steps.

Representative: Erik Erlingsson

Mr. Erlingsson presented photos of existing conditions and reviewed the proposed work. He explained that the proposed handrail would be made to match the design of the abutting property at 31 Chestnut Street.

The Commission felt that the proposed railing is appropriate for the building, and that railing should match exactly to the neighboring property.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

- **In conclusion the application was approved. D. Santos initiated the motion and P. T. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**

41 Chestnut Street (19.994 BH): At front façade restore and re-paint entry door.

Representative: Brad Richards

Mr. Richards showed photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work.

The Commission discussed the appropriateness of the proposed paint color. The applicant presented Newport Blue as a second paint color option which was well received by the Commission.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application with provisos.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. P. Vineburgh initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**
 - **Newport Blue be used for the paint color of the door.**

55 Chestnut Street (19.814 BH): At front façade replace non-historic front door and hardware in-kind; and re-paint door, door surround, window trim window sash, shutters and window boxes.

Representatives: Monika Pauli

Ms. Pauli presented photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work. The Commission questioned why the door needed to be replaced and concurred that the proposed paint colors are appropriate.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application with provisos.

- **In conclusion the application was approved. M. Rosales initiated the motion and P. T. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**

158 Mount Vernon Street (19.1009 BH): At rear elevation replace existing wooden garage door, posts and header with wood door, posts and header, and repair and reset brick pavers.

Representatives: Dustin Nolin

Mr. Nolin presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work.

The Commission questioned how the proposed handle will work, and asked if it will be made of brass and if it can be painted black.

During public comment, a butter Fred Putnam asked about the view of the photo.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application with provisos.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. P. T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**
 - **Handle is to be painted black**

74 Chestnut Street (19.1006 BH): At rear elevation replace existing wooden garage door with black steel door.

Representatives: Ryan Garrity

Mr. Garrity presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work, and explained that the proposed design of the door is slightly different to the existing door, and necessary for the motor of the door opener to function properly.

The Commission discussed the inappropriateness of steel used for the door.

During public comment, Fred Putnam asked if the wood door would be lighter or heavier. Richelle Gewertz from the Beacon Hill Civic Association stated that the door should be wood.

Staff read its recommendation to deny the application without prejudice.

- **In conclusion the application was denied without prejudice. J. Pierce initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**

25 Phillips Street (19.915 BH): At rear elevation install brick in front of concrete block infill at second story window opening and install bathroom vent.

Representatives: Ted Toran

Mr. Toran presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work.

The Commission felt that the brick and vent that were proposed are suitable and minimally visible from the adjacent park.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application with provisos.

- **In conclusion the application was approved with provisos. D. Santos initiated the motion and P. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**
 - **Details of the brick and mortar is remanded to staff**

28 Pinckney Street (19.1004 BH): Replace existing in-filled garage door opening with new overhead garage door painted black; paint existing door black; remove existing paint from masonry; and restore curb cut and sidewalk (work previously approved by BHAC on June 18, 2015).

Representatives: Monika Pauli and Fred Lebo

Ms. Pauli presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work.

The Commission discussed the changes to the sidewalk, and the appropriateness of the proposed garage door and metal sidewalk grates.

There was no public comment.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application.

In conclusion the application was continued. P. T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).

- **The Commission requested that other design options including a barn door solution be explored for the garage door; clearer drawings of the existing conditions and proposed alterations to the sidewalk be submitted; and that a better solution to the metal grates be considered, such as the current brick option at Chestnut Street and West Cedar Street.**

25 Charles Street (19.796 BH): At Charles Street façade relocate entry and install new entry doors, replace and lengthen first-story windows, repair and replace existing cornice and awning brackets as needed, recover awning; at Branch Street elevation create new window openings; and replace wooden window shutters at Charles Street façade and Branch Street elevation

Representatives: Curtis Kemeny, Andrew Keating, Frank McGuire

Mr. McGuire presented two separate options for their proposed work.

The Commission felt that some details of the applications were missing so that the full scope of the project was incomplete, and could not agree on the best solution for new window fenestration on Charles Street.

During public comment, Richelle Gewertz from the Beacon Hill Civic Association stated that the Branch Street windows should be six-over-six windows matching the existing windows at this elevation.

Staff read its recommendation to approve the application with provisos.

In conclusion the application was continued. M. Rosales initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).

- **The Commission requested that that the proposed Branch Street windows match the size of the existing windows at that elevation; the first-story window on Chestnut street match the Branch Street windows, and that the applicant re-study the design of the first-story windows at Charles Street and explore options to retain the current sill height with plate glass and different transom designs.**

144-158 Charles Street (19.873 BH): At roof remove existing antennas and mounting hardware on chimney and relocate inside three new fiberglass canisters.

Representatives: Edward D. Pare, Jr., Esq.

Mr. Pare presented the photos of existing conditions and plans for the proposed work.

The Commission discussed the guidelines which prohibit antennas from being visible from a public way.

During public comment, Gene Clapp expressed his opposition to the proposed antennas.

Staff read its recommendation to deny the application without prejudice.

- **In conclusion the application was denied. M. Rosales initiated the motion and J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR).**

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

19.998 BH 4 Acorn Street: At front façade repair windows and window shutters, and re-paint front steps and fire escape.

19.1000 BH 61 Beacon Street: At front façade repair brick cornice at roofline.

19.1005 BH 76 Chestnut Street: At front replace eight pairs of wood window shutters in-kind.

19.921 BH 20 Pinckney Street: At front façade replace second-story granite window sill in-kind.

In conclusion the applications above were approved with provisos. P. T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (DS, PTV, JP, MR). M. Rosales recused himself for the vote for application 19.921 BH 20 Pinckney Street. The vote for that application was 3-0-1 (Y: JP, DS, PTV; N :0; ABS: MR).

Ratification of the March 21, 2019 Public Hearing Minutes

- In conclusion the minutes were approved. P. T. Vineburgh initiated the motion and D. Santos seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0 (JP, MR, DS, PTV).

8:43 PM M. Rosales adjourned the public hearing.