



BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

Public Hearing Minutes

Boston City Hall, Piemonte Room Boston, MA, 02201

May 21, 2020

Commissioners Present: Arian Allen, Joel Pierce, P.T. Vineburgh, Alice Richmond, Miguel Rosales

Staff Present: Nicholas Armata, Senior Preservation Planner, Joseph Cornish, Director of Design Review

5:00 PM Commissioner Rosales called the public hearing to order.

I. DESIGN

APP # 19.118 BH 55-57 Brimmer Street (Continued from 9-2018)

Applicant: Don Mills Mills, Whitaker Architects

Proposed Work: Changes to the design of the faux carriage house doors facing Brimmer Street.

Applicant Don Mills provided the details to his project that was previously approved in September of 2018. The property owners decided that they would like to swap out the faux carriage house doors for operable windows. Additionally, the stairs leading up to the upper level would change location. The reason for the change is related to the future use of the space as a classroom. The property owners wished to allow more lighting into the classroom space.

The Commission discussed the proposal and commented that the proposal was not appropriate when considering the context of the street and the historic use of the property. The proposed windows did not look right at the front of the structure, especially because there was an existing curb cut that was used for the original door before the original structure was torn down.

During public comment members of the public also expressed concern for the new proposal and asked that the original plan was kept as is with the transom windows. In conclusion the application was approved with the provisos that the faux door plans remain and that the staircase relocation is approved.

J. Pierce motioned to approve the application, A. Richmond seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP #19.118 BH

MOTION by: Pierce; **SECOND** by: Richmond

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** None

*Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>



APP # 20.1011 BH 3 Park Street

Applicant: Don Mills; Mills, Whitaker Architects

Proposed Work: Replace select insulated glass in kind as indicated on application, replace existing intercom system, replace existing copper chimney cap with vented copper chimney cap to restore chimney to its original use.

Applicant Don Mills presented the details of the proposal for 3 Park Street. Several of the windows were replaced over the years with insulated glass. Those windows were now failing resulting in foggy glass and condensation in the internal components. Additionally, the chimney cap is to be reconfigured to allow for its original use. The applicant provided several different options of this chimney cap that included a copper cap. Finally, the applicant presented the proposal for a new intercom system, which would replace the existing unit which was dated and did not function well.

The Commission discussed the proposal; they saw no issue with the window replacement, they asked for the glass to match existing reflectivity. In regards to the chimney cap, the commission unanimously preferred the copper cap option. Finally, the Commission discussed the intercom, and felt that the proposed intercom system is fine, but it must be incorporated into a brass box on the façade. The Commission provided a recent approval example at 108 Mt. Vernon Street as a model intercom box.

In conclusion, the application was approved with the provisos that the chimney cap is the copper option, and that the intercom is installed inside a brass box. Details are to be submitted to staff for final approval.

M. Rosales motioned to approve the application, J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 4-1-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1011 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; **SECOND** by: Pierce

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** Richmond

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 20.1012 BH 19 Myrtle Street

Applicant: Craig Cody; T-Mobile NE

Proposed Work: At roof level, remove existing panel antennas and replace with new panel antennas. Paint to match existing.

The applicant presented the details of the project that involved replacing several cell phone antennas mounted on the side of the head house at the top of the structure. These antennas were previously approved by the commission and were painted to match the head house clad. The antennas are visible from several angles throughout the district.

The Commission discussed the proposal and asked the applicant if there were other areas these antennas could be mounted. Additionally, the Commission questioned whether a fiberglass screen would further reduce the visibility of the antennas in terms of their shadow lines.

During public comment, residents of the neighborhood expressed concern for a fiberglass shield and suggested that the antennas are approved as submitted. In conclusion, the Commission voted to approve the application with the provisos that the applicant explore installing a fiberglass shield and submit the details to staff. If it is determined that the shield is too bulky or makes the antennas more visible, the original proposal is approved.

M. Rosales motioned to approve the application, P. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 4-1-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1012 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; **SECOND** by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** Richmond

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beam-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 20.1013 BH 34 West Cedar Street

Applicant: Pauli & Uribe Architects LLC

Proposed Work: At dormer level, repair and repaint trim in kind. Repair and replace slate in kind
(See Additional Items under Administrative Review).

The applicant, Monkia Pauli, of Pauli & Uribe Architects provided details to the scope of the project, which was mostly reviewed administratively. The elements that needed Commission approval under design review was the cladding of a non-historic dormer level at the top front of the property. This dormer currently has half wood and half slate cladding. The applicant mentioned that they were happy to take any recommendations that the Commission would have.

The Commission discussed the proposal and suggested that the cladding was all one material, preferably slate. Details of these changes are to be submitted to staff for final approval

During the public comment period the Civic Association recommended the same changes. In conclusion, the application was approved with the provisos that the dormer is clad entirely in slate, rather than the half wood and half slate that currently exists. Details of this change are to be submitted to staff for final approval.

M. Rosales motioned to approve the application, P. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1013 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; **SECOND** by: Vineburgh

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** None

*Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>



APP # 20.1014 BH 41 Beacon Street

Applicant: Susan A. Lester

Proposed Work: At front façade garden level, install new gas line through wall. Paint to match existing.

Applicant Susan Lester presented her proposal to install a gas line at the front of her building. This includes a meter that will be installed within the granite garden wall. The meter will be painted grey and obscured by a rhododendron bush and would not be visible from any point on Beacon Street.

The Commission discussed the proposal and what could be done to make the equipment less visible. Staff suggested that the meter be installed below the main granite band so that it does not disturb the original granite. The Commission also asked that there be some sort of screening that is painted to match the surrounding to further shield the view of the equipment from any public way.

During public comment several members of the community expressed concern for this project being a precedent for harming the historic fabric of the community. In conclusion the application was approved with the provisos that the gas line and meter are installed below the granite block and that a screening is installed.

M. Rosales motioned to approve the application, J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1013 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; **SECOND** by: Pierce

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 20.1015 BH 45 Temple Street

Applicant: David Raftery; JDMD OWNER LLC

Proposed Work: At Temple Street facade, install building street number.

David Raftery, the applicant, provided the details to the project. This is one of the last remaining elements of the conversion/renovation of the former Suffolk University Law School. The project consists of installing the address number at the main entrance on Temple Street. There were two options one being larger than the other. The font was selected from the front entablature of the older portion of the building.

The Commission discussed the proposal and determined that the larger element was acceptable, but should be made using a metal/color seen around the frame of the door.

During public comment, the Civic Association requested for the number to be in style/font that is more synonymous with mid-century modern more so than the font on the older portion of the structure. In conclusion the Commission voted to approve the application with the provisos that the larger option is installed and that the materials are similar to those seen around the entrance way.

M. Rosales motioned to approve the application, P.T. Vineburgh seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1015 BH

MOTION by: Rosales; **SECOND** by: Pierce

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** None

**Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>*



APP # 20.1010 BH 4 Walnut Street

Applicant: Arnie Wright; Four Walnut Street Condominium Assoc.

Proposed Work: Paint front door, fire escapes and archway in kind.

The applicant, Arnie Wright, provided the details of the project which consists of repainting the fire escape and front door, archway in kind.

The Commission reviewed the application and agreed that the proposed color is acceptable.

During public comment the civic association questioned why this application was listed under design review. Staff commented that it was in the best interest of the applicant to place the application under design review based on previous reviews. In conclusion the application was approved as submitted.

P.T. Vineburgh motioned to approve the application, A. Allen seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0 (AA, JP, AR, MR, and PV).

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1010 BH

MOTION by: Vineburgh; **SECOND** by: Allen

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Richmond, Rosales*, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** None

*Indicates vote which was counted towards the final decision based on participation. For more information, please refer to the enabling legislation online at <https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>



APP # 20.1016 BH 54 Pinckney Street

Applicant: John Corey; Beacon Hill Housewrights, LLC

Proposed Work: At front façade, install alarm bell in the entryway of the front door.

The applicant, John Corey, provided the details to its proposal which includes installing a small alarm bell on the inside of an entryway. The location was chosen in order to minimize visual disruptions of the front façade.

The Commission discussed whether the location and size was appropriate, there were no objections. It was requested that the bell be painted, if possible, so as to reduce the visibility.

During public comment there were no objections to the project. There were comments that were made that were not relevant to the discussion and thus not recorded in the minutes. In conclusion the application was approved with the provisos that the applicant explores painting the bells a different color. A later conversation between the applicant and the staff determined that this was not possible.

P.T. Vineburgh motioned to approve the application, A. Allen seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-1 (AA, JP, AR, and PV) MR Recused himself from the vote.

RECORD OF VOTE ON APP: # 20.1016 BH

MOTION by: Vineburgh; **SECOND** by: Allen

AFFIRMATIVE: Allen*, Pierce*, Richmond, Vineburgh* **NEGATIVE:** None



APP # 20.1017 BH 10.5 Beacon Street

APPROVED AS SUBMITTED 5-0-0 (AA₂, JP, AR, MR, PT₁)

Applicant: Matthew Bronski P.E; Simpson, Gumpertz & Heger

Proposed Work: At rear façade facing cemetery, remove and replace non-original existing railings on the balconies of levels two and five. Install new copper gutter on floor five.

The applicant, Matthew Bronski, presented the details of the proposal which consists of making two of the rear balconies code compliant. Additionally, the proposal is meant to reflect some of the original detailing better by aligning the rails in accordance to the architecture of the rear of the building.

The Commission discussed the proposal and thanked the applicant for providing such a comprehensive application package together.

During the public comment period there were no objections to the project. In conclusion the application was approved as submitted.

P.T. Vineburgh motioned to approve the application, A. Allen seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-1 (AA, JP, AR, and PV) MR Recused himself from the vote.

II. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW/APPROVAL: *In order to expedite the review process, the commission has delegated the approval of certain work items, such as those involving ordinary maintenance and repair, restoration or replacement, or which otherwise have a minimal impact on a building's appearance, to commission staff pending ratification at its monthly public hearing. **Having been identified as meeting these eligibility criteria and all applicable guidelines, the following applications will be approved at this hearing:***

► Applicants whose projects are listed under this heading **NEED NOT APPEAR** at the hearing. Following the hearing, you will be issued a Determination Sheet to present at the Inspectional Services Department (1010 Massachusetts Avenue) as proof of project approval when applying for permits. ISD personnel will send an electronic copy of your building-permit application to the commission staff for review. (To avoid potential confusion, the text of your building-permit application should be consistent with the project description given below.) Commission staff will accordingly authorize the execution of the work, attaching any applicable provisos, reflecting the relevant guidelines and precedents.

► **PLEASE NOTE THAT FOLLOWING ISSUANCE OF THE DETERMINATION SHEET NO FURTHER CORRESPONDENCE WILL BE ISSUED FOR THE APPLICATIONS LISTED BELOW.** The electronic building-permit application as annotated by commission staff will constitute your Certificate of Appropriateness; this will be valid for one year from the date of the hearing. The applicant is required to notify the commission of any project changes; failure to do so may affect the status of the approval.



► If you have any questions not addressed by the above information, please contact staff at 617.635.3850 or BeaconHillAC@boston.gov Thank you.

APP # 20.1013 BH 34 Cedar Street: At front and rear facades; repoint brick as required. Mortar mixture shall be 1 part cement to 2 parts lime to 7 parts sand. Replace all rotted or damaged exterior trim and siding to match existing. Paint all siding, trim and window sashes to match existing. Repair existing lead flashing throughout as required. Repair/replace rubber roofing, gutter and chimney flashing at ell (See *Additional Items Under Design Review*).

APP # 20.991 BH 77 Joy Street: Replace all four “swing-out” windows on level two of the front façade. Windows will be replaced like for like made from wood. Structure is built in the mid-century modern style.

P.T. Vineburgh motioned to approve the administrative items, A. Allen seconded the motion. The vote was 4-0-1 (MR, AA, JP, and PV) AR Abstained

III. RATIFICATION OF 2/20/2020 AND 4/16/2020 PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES & 1/15/2020 PUBLIC SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

M. Rosales motioned to approve the minutes, J. Pierce seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0-0

- IV. Staff Updates**
- V. Adjourn – 7:14**

J. Pierce motioned to adjourn the hearing. M. Rosales seconded the motion. The vote was 5-0 (PD, JP, MR, DS, and PV).

BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

Members: MO: Arian Allen, BHCA: Joel Pierce, HNE: Miguel Rosales,
BSA: Danielle Santos, GBREB: P.T. Vineburgh,
Alternates: MO: Alice Richmond, BHCA Matthew Blumenthal,
HNE: Vacancy, BSA: Wen Wen, GBREB: Vacancy